

Special Meeting of Council Agenda

Date: November 25, 2024

Time: 9:30 am

Location: Council Chambers Level 2, City Hall

Pages

1. Call to Order:

2. Land Acknowledgement:

Burlington as we know it today is rich in history and modern traditions of many First Nations and the Métis. From the Ah-nish-nah-beg (Anishinaabeg) to the Ho-den-oh-sho-nee (Haudenosaunee), and the Métis – our lands spanning from Lake Ontario to the Niagara Escarpment are steeped in Indigenous history. The territory is mutually covered by the Dish with One Spoon Wampum Belt Covenant, an agreement between the Iroquois Confederacy, the Ojibway and other allied Nations to peaceably share and care for the resources around the Great Lakes.

We acknowledge that the land on which we gather is part of the Treaty Lands and Territory of the Mississaugas of the Credit.

- 3. Roll Call:
- 4. Approval of the Agenda:
- Declarations of Interest:
- 6. Presentations:

7. Delegations:

In order to speak at a Council meeting, Individuals must register as a delegation no later than noon the business day before the meeting. To register, complete the online application at www.burlington.ca/delegation or by submitting a written request by email to Legislative Services at clerks@burlington.ca
If you do not wish to delegate, but would like to submit feedback, please email your comments to clerks@burlington.ca by noon the business day before the meeting.

Your comments will be circulated to Council members in advance of the meeting and will be attached to the minutes, forming part of the public record.

7.1 Anthony Salemi representing West End Home Builder's Association will speak regarding 2025 Budget review (F-38-24)

8. Petitions:

9. Items to be considered at the Special Meeting of Council:

9.1 2025 Budget review (F-38-24)

Endorse the 2025 Operating Budget including any approved budget amendments to be applied against the proposed net tax levy amount of \$264,343,845; and

Endorse that any surplus or deficit resulting from a difference between the actual results and the estimated 0.75% City portion of the net assessment growth be transferred to / from the Tax Rate Stabilization Reserve Fund; and

Endorse the 2025 Capital Budget for the City of Burlington, with a gross amount of \$\$105,425,263 with a debenture requirement of \$8,950,000, and the 2026-2034 capital forecast with a gross amount of \$994,403,942 with a debenture requirement of \$30,179,850 as outlined in the 2025 Budget Overview (F-36-24) and as amended by Council; and

Administer the debenture in the amount of \$8,950,000 in 2025 as tax supported debt; and

Declare that, in accordance with s. 5(1)5 of the Development Charges Act, 1997 and s. 5 of Ontario Regulation 82/98, it is Council's clear intention that the excess capacity provided by the above-referenced works will be paid for by future development charges.

10. Confidential Items and Closed Session:

Confidential reports may require a closed meeting in accordance with the Municipal Act, 2001. Meeting attendees may be required to leave during the discussion.

11. Rise and Report

12. Motion to Receive and File Information Items:

Receive and file information items, having been considered by Council:

12.1 Correspondence from Eric Stern regarding 2025 Budget review and approval (F-38-24)

1 - 12

13. Motion to Confirm Proceedings of the Council Meeting:

13 - 14

Enact and pass By-law Number 72-2024 being a by-law to confirm the proceedings of Special Council at its meeting held Monday, November 25, 2024 being read a first, second and third time.

14. Motion to Adjourn:

Adjourn this Council now to meet again at the call of the Mayor.

I am writing regarding the proposed 2025 City of Burlington budget.

The BRAG team is still reviewing the budget. As a group of volunteers, we are moving as quickly as we can through the 615-page document. Mayor Meed Ward has restricted public access to the budget details limiting our ability to conduct a thorough review. Oakville, where strong mayor powers are in effect, provides a detailed budget for a full 55 days before council votes. In Burlington, we are granted 30 days by our strong mayor.

We have put together a list of 25 items below.

This list suggests reducing some staff positions. The turnover rate, the rate at which staff voluntarily leave the employ of the city is over 5%. No one needs to lose their job, if our suggestions are acted upon some people may end up with different jobs. The average salary for a full-time employee at the City of Burlington, in 2025, is over \$100,000 a year. This does not include benefits, computers, software, office space, or management costs. What is commonly referred to as the "burdened" cost for a City of Burlington employee can easily average over \$200,000 a year.

All sectors have seen significant increases in salary costs for software developers and many other IT-related professions. Residents can't be expected to pay for in-house development efforts. A Region of Halton shared service approach, properly implemented, could save significant amounts of money and deliver better services for taxpayers.

The budget constantly refers to spending as "investments". Typically people make investments expecting a return on that investment. The budget talks about lots of investments but rarely, if ever, returns. The Office 365 technology investment is a simple example. Private sector companies invest in Office 365 and get a return through reduced desktop support leading to reduced IT costs. Future budgets need to document the investment and the return taxpayers can expect from the investment.

One thing we all need to keep in mind as the council moves through the budget amendment process is that last year the mayor's budget released in October of 2023 called for a 10.21% tax increase. The increase we saw on line one of our tax bills was 10.21%. Bateman didn't open, and no new staff were hired but we were taxed for the salaries for those positions. The 2025 budget again calls for new staff for Bateman and Skyway. The increase built into the 2024 budget should be used to pay for these positions.

#	Reference	Description	\$
1	EV Chargers	The new high-speed chargers at 391 Brant are not compatible with the North American Charging Standard (NACS) adopted by Ford, GM and others in 2023. All Teslas use the NACS.	\$100,000

		The low-speed chargers charge at such a slow rate and can only be used for 4 hours at a time. These chargers have the potential to discourage people from buying electric cars. People are not going to charge for 12 to 16 hours, moving their car every 4 hours. The new high-speed chargers at 391 Brant St. compete directly with the Tesla chargers at MapleView and the Flo chargers outside of Dennigers (Burlington Centre). Why is the city competing with Tesla and Flo to add chargers?	
2	Windrow clearing	What is the cost of this program? Last year the program was only open to people without someone in the house who could clear the snow. Now it's open to everyone. This is another example of the city competing with private enterprises. The commitment is to clear the driveway 36 hours after a snowfall, is this useful? The cost of this program needs to include staff costs to administer the program, collect the revenue, schedule the plowing, deal with the inevitable phone calls, etc. etc. This program made sense when it was limited to people who needed it. As soon as it's open to everyone the staff costs will outweigh any benefit. Why is the city competing with the landscapers and other private contractors who plow snow in the winter?	
3	Play Structures	Why does Burlington replace play structures every 10 years? The structure at Bronte Waterfront Park in Oakville is at least 15 years old. The "Fort" at High Park in Toronto is close to 50 years old. If other municipalities can manage the risk/liability around older play structures why can't Burlington? Replacing existing play structures less often would allow for more play structures, for example, in Brekon Park.	
4	Play Structures	Full-time play structure designer staff position. Can't the city issue an RFP and let the neighbourhood select the winning bid within a price range? We might	\$200,000

		get some interesting play structures and some variations in structures this way. We'd also save the cost of having a full-time play structure designer on staff.	
5	Leaf Collection	Councilor Stolte put forward a budget request to remove the cost of leaf collection from the 2025 budget. As Oakville and Milton have collection programs we need to understand how much more the region will charge for trash collection if Burlington cancels the loose-leaf program. We also need to understand the true savings in cancelling this program. We know that full-time city employees use equipment that the city owns to collect leaves. If the program is cancelled will staff members be laid off?	
6	Neighbourhood Parties	BRAG is not a group of party poopers but what is the true cost of this program? If 3 full-time people work on these programs the costs go from the \$200,000 handed out to over \$800,000. You're giving us back our money but at what cost?	
7	Rambo Creek	Erosion control.	\$2,000,000
		2026 expense - Page 533 - SM-SD-2046 - Victoria to Emerald - \$2 million dollars - cost per meter is approximately \$8,264	
		This is right behind No-Frills on Brant. The plaza is slated for redevelopment, should the developer be paying for this or should the money be coming from a development fund? \$2 million is a lot of money for about 246 meters of creek. Sounds like a concrete diversion channel more than erosion control, on the backs of taxpayers to help the developer.	
8	Debt Charges	Page 261 shows debt charges increasing by 7.3%, this is concerning when interest rates are declining. The same line on the same page shows the city is paying \$13,200,000 in debt charges in 2025. Yet the city is borrowing \$8,950,000 more in 2025. IS THIS LEVEL OF DEBT, BORROWING AND	
		INTEREST PAYMENTS SUSTAINABLE?	
9	CAO / Corporate Affairs - new	New position - Director Strategic Initiatives 2025 - \$215,000 in salary plus the cost of benefits.	\$215,000
	hire	From the budget:	

	RCC-11-24	"In 2023, the Council approved a business case to undergo the development of an Accountability Framework for Agencies, Boards, Commissions (ABC) and Joint Ventures (JV). The intent behind this work was to bring about accountability and role clarity for relationships and partners with whom the city does business. In May 2024, Staff brought a follow up report to council (RCC-11-24) seeking endorsement of the ABC and JV framework. Among other items this framework is aimed at addressing entity structure, risk, shared services. Each entity that the city partners with must have a detailed service and/or lease agreement that will clearly spell out performance metrics and reporting framework on a go-forward basis. An investment in contracted services will be needed to implement this Accountability Framework and support the corporate review of partnership proposals. These contracted services, will be managed by the new Director of Strategic Initiatives position given the cross-organization, financial, legal and multi-stakeholder impacts of this initiative." If the work is going to be contracted out can't this fall under the auditor or legal or some existing structure? Why is a new position required with a significant salary?	
10	Dedicated Lawer in the IT department	In 2023 a full-time legal position was created in the Burlington Digital Services department. The justification was that Burlington would be buying lots of software and a lawyer would be needed to manage the contracts. Fast forward to today, Burlington has bought lots of software, perhaps the lawyer can take over the responsibilities required in the CAO corporate affairs position listed in item 10. Once SaaS contracts are in place is there still a need for a full-time lawyer in the BDS department?	
11	Web and Digital Marketing - new hire	PAGE 48 - New position in "Web and Digital Marketing". The description from the budget: "As the City of Burlington's primary source of current and local information, particularly following the discontinuation of the Burlington Post and during emergencies like the pandemic, our website—with its 1.5 million annual users—is a critical communication channel that necessitates specialized management.	

		The current hybrid toom, while chilled in such and	
		The current hybrid team, while skilled in web and graphic design, is primarily tasked with creating on-demand materials for diverse communication channels. To meet our evolving web support needs, a dedicated resource with advanced capabilities in website management and digital marketing is vital. The introduction of a Web and Digital Marketing Advisor would not only ensure the proactive strategic management of web content and the accuracy of information but also enhance our online presence through expert SEO practices. This role is increasingly important as we implement new tools such as a generative AI digital assistant, which relies on precise website data to address resident inquiries. A dedicated advisor is therefore crucial to improve online services, user experience, and the city's digital reputation"	
		Is the city selling advertising on the website? Do we really need to spend \$148K to enhance the online presence through search engine optimization (SEO)?	
		COBY was supposed to make things easier to find. Did it?	
		Every project in BDS needs to have a payback associated with it - what is the payback on this? Making things easier to find is not an answer. If the city just posted more information to its website google will find the information and make it searchable - for free!	
12	Turnover Rates - Page 209	The city has presented their staff turnover rate as 5.3% if you back out retirements the voluntary turnover rate is 2.2%.	
		Here are some private industry stats	
		Workforce turnover insights for Canada In Canada, the average voluntary turnover rate sits at 11.9%. Again, the Retail and Wholesale industry leads with a 25.9% turnover rate, while the Energy industry has one of the lowest at 8%.	
		Here's how voluntary turnover rates vary by employee group in Canada:	
		Head of organizations and executives: 3.8% Management: 6.6% Sales professionals: 6.4%	

		Non-sales professionals: 8.3% White collar professionals: 10.5% Blue collar professionals: 11.5% Higher positions tend to have lower turnover rates, likely due to better compensation, positive work environments, strong support systems, and more autonomy in their roles.¹ A turnover rate of 2.2% without retirees and 5.3% including retirees is incredibly low and may indicate high pay, great benefits, etc.	
		From the budget we have calculated that the salary increases, in 2025, will average to 5%. This feels rich when you look at the turnover rates. The talking point from councillors is - if we don't pay people well they leave and we end up training new people who then turn around and leave. That is all BS (Burlington Speak) when you look at the actual turnover rate people are not leaving. The actual turnover rate was low last year (2023) as well. The higher projected turnover rates in 2025, 2026 etc are just projections. If the higher rates are driven by retirements no end of salary increases will slow down the retirements.	
13	Communication s Department HR costs	Page 216 shows a 20.1% increase in wages and benefits, in dollar terms that is a \$787,000 increase. This is for the communications department. The description states "Human Resources increase is comprised provisions for the annual performance adjustment, range movement, payroll taxes (EI, CPP, EHT), WSIB, OMERS and group benefits. Also included is the impact of re-ratings resulting from a change in the scope of some positions within this department and of a conversion of a position from part time to full-time. The adjustments in Contracted and Professional Services and Transfers from Reserve Funds reflect the removal of the Vision	

https://www.imercer.com/articleinsights/workforce-turnover-trends-canada#:~:text=Workforce% 20turnover%20insights%20for%20Canada,Blue%20collar%20professionals:%2011.5%25

¹ Reference:

		2025 project (2024 Key Invesment 2024-040) as this was a one-time project in 2024 and therefore not carried forward into the 2025 budget."	
		This is difficult to understand.	
14	Communication s Department Contracting and Professional Services	Contracting and professional services are increasing 21.5% - why?	
15	Communication s Initiative #1	This is the number 1 initiative for the communications department in 2025.	
		"Ensuring the City maintains a strong, positive reputation by effectively managing communications and engagement efforts. We will look to media reach and sentiment metrics as we work to increase the reach of media coverage about the City by 5% and contribute to positive and neutral media coverage about the City at or above 70%."	
		This is offensive to have taxpayers pay money to a department whose sole job is to spin the information coming out of the city, or about the city, to make the city look "positive and neutral".	
		BRAG believes the gym floors should be fixed, the basketball nets should have nets and the city should spend money on things that benefit taxpayers, not on communications people to make our elected representatives look "positive or neutral".	
16	Communication s	This department plans to spend \$1,157,000 on "Contracted and Professional Services" in 2025, a 17.1% increase over 2024.	
		BRAG believes a constant stream of Facebook posts, posts on Twitter, and posts on every other social media platform, is not an effective use of taxpayers' dollars.	
17	Burlington Digital Services Page 316	Page 316 represents almost \$62 million in spending (over 10 years) with no details.	

		The trend for the public and private sector is to vendor-supported cloud applications. Burlington is moving to Office 365, this is a perfect example of a vendor-supported cloud application. You pay \$30 a month per user, Microsoft provides the cloud infrastructure hardware and keeps the hardware and software up to date, Workday is another example of a cloud-based SaaS application. Most of the new software being installed should be SaaS, renewals and infrastructure costs should go down, and monthly subscription costs should go up. Burlington should provide more details to help taxpayers understand where and why \$62 million is	
18	Customer Relationship Management (CRM)	Page 321 "The City is committed to enhancing its Customer Experience strategy by addressing challenges identified during the initial implementation of our Customer Relationship Management (CRM) system. In alignment with our evolving Digital Business Strategy, we are embarking on a new CRM rollout. This initiative began with the development and deployment of a Minimum Viable Product (MVP) in a specific area, allowing us to assess the system's effectiveness before broader implementation"	
		This sounds like an in-house software development effort of a CRM application. Words like Minimum Viable Product indicate this is in-house. Why is Burlington developing custom software, especially in areas like CRM where there are thousands of packaged and cloud (SaaS) solutions on the market? Even if the initial development cost is lower the maintenance costs will be high, the developers quit, no one understands how the software was written, the technology changes and the application needs a major upgrade. All these problems are eliminated with SaaS solutions.	
19	Customer Centric Digital	"The Customer Centric Digital Architecture Blueprint supports the Burlington Digital Business Strategy	

	T	T	
	Architecture Blueprint Implementation.	through establishing foundational common and reusable platforms, and at the same time is open to agility, flexibility and innovations so that the City can respond to ever-growing demand and expectations from the City's customers in this new digital-era and other disruptive factors that drive the change. The funding is to support planning and implementing the Customer Centric Digital Architecture Blueprint, through an incremental approach, with initial focus on Portal and Web Form Platform and Customer Identity and Access Management Platform; Future platforms also include a Secure Online Payment Platform, a Unified Customer Notification Platform, Application and Data Integration Platforms, and other data and security platforms."	
		Page 326 - IT-CA-2130	
		Cost 4 Full-time employees plus \$700,000 in spending spread over 3 years (2025 to 2027). This looks like a complex implementation of user authentication (OAuth) there are dozens of OAuth providers.	
		There is no way to know what is going on from the budget description.	
		We did ask COBY "Please share the City of Burlington IT-CA-2130 report details"	
		COBY replied, "I'm unsure if your question is related to the City of Burlington."	
20	Digital Platforming and Application Rationalization	Page 323 - "Citizens, businesses, and employees now expect extensive online, enablement, and self-serve options for service delivery. To meet these expectations and fulfill our commitment to a digital vision, we have identified significant resource, process, skill, and technology gaps that could impede our ability to achieve our Vision to Focus (V2F) and Digital Transformation goals."	
		The details also talk about digital twins. Digital twins make sense with complex assets, a water treatment plant or a wastewater plant are good examples. We are struggling with what assets Burlington has that would justify a digital twin. It's really cool technology but you can manage a building or a storm sewer system without digital twins.	

		1 - wha 2 - wha 3 - wha The up mainta engine in the to Self-se sound a day of website people sector	estions are at assets requate is the cost? at is the paybate in the twin calcering change win. The options, or op	e is sigr n be hig made i online e ere is th vice Bu uce that urlingtor	nificant and the paybase of the payb	and the co ell, every fe has to l ent, the ack? Say i, with a d payback i ack in the	be made ese all 50 calls ifferent s fewer public	
21	Salary Increases	\$150 M per 202 per 202 Percent Cumula 18.74% Accord average from 2. first ha	Salaries, wages and benefits per 2023 annual report - \$150 Million per 2024 budget - \$170Million per 2025 budget - \$181Million Percentage increase 2024 over 2023 - 11.0 % Percentage increase 2025 over 2024 - 6.97% Cumulative percentage increase since 2023 – 18.74% According to Ontario.ca/Collective Bargaining, the average increase of public sector workers ranged from 2.5% to 4% for the last quarter of 2023 and the first half of 2024. Combine this with item 12, above, on turnover.					
22	Salary Comparisons	City Burlington Hamilton Oakville City Burlington Hamilton Oakville	Position Exec Director CFO General Manager Finance & Corporate Services Commissioner Corporate Services and Treasurer Position Executive Director HR Executive Director HR	\$alary \$254,46 \$254,394 \$242,790 \$alary \$256,835 \$229,225 \$196,948	City Budget \$434.8M \$2.4B \$592.3M \$In the second se	City Population 194,000 589,748 233,700 Population 194,000 589,748 233,700		

What justifies the premium the City of Burlington is paying in comparison to its closest neighbours both in the size of budgets being managed and the size of its workforce?

Fraser Research Institute – Comparing Government and Private Sector Compensation in Ontario, 2023 Edition Using data on individual workers from January to December 2021, this report estimates the wage differential between the government and private sectors in Ontario

Main Conclusions:

1. After controlling for factors like gender, age, marital status, education, tenure, size of rm, job permanence, immigrant status, industry, occupation, and full- or part-time status, the authors found that workers in Ontario's government sector (federal, provincial, and local) enjoyed a 10.9% wage premium, on average, over their private-sector counterparts

in 2021. When unionization status is factored into the analysis, the wage premium for the government sector declines to 8.8%.

- 2. The available data on non-wage benefits suggest that the government sector enjoys an advantage over the private sector. For example, 83.9% of government workers in Ontario are covered by a registered pension plan, compared to 25.1% of private-sector workers. Of those covered by a registered pension plan, 94.5% of government workers enjoyed a defined benefit pension compared to 36.9% of private sector workers
- 3. Government workers retire earlier than their private-sector counterparts— about 2.5 years on average—and are much less likely to lose their jobs (5.5% annual job loss rate in the private sector compared to 1.3% in the public sector).
- 4. Full-time workers in the government sector lost more work time in 2021 for personal reasons (14.0 days on average) than their private-sector

		counterparts (8.8 days) 5. In Ontario in 2021, the components of total employment were as follows: 15% self employed 19.8% public sector 65.3% private sector	
23	Enabling Departments	Corporate Affairs	
24	Fire Department administration costs	Facilities and Administration Costs will increase 18% in 2025. Station 9, downtown, is not expected to be built until 2029. Why? Salaries are increasing 6.5%.	
25	Transit	The transit master plan should be released before taxes are increased in relation to transit.	

Eric Stern Ward 4

The Corporation of the City of Burlington

City of Burlington By-law 72-2024

A by-law to confirm the proceedings of the meeting of Council of the Corporation of the City of Burlington held on Monday, November 25, 2024

Whereas according to Section 5 of the *Municipal Act*, 2001, c. 25 as it may be amended from time to time, the powers of The Corporation of the City of Burlington are to be exercised by the Council of The Corporation of the City of Burlington and municipal powers are to be exercised by by-law; and

Whereas it is deemed expedient that the actions of the Council of The Corporation of the City of Burlington be confirmed and adopted by by-law;

Now therefore the Council of the Corporation of the City of Burlington hereby enacts as follows:

- The actions of the Council of The Corporation of the City of Burlington in respect
 of:
 - (a) each recommendation in the report of the Committees;
 - (b) Each motion, resolution and other action passed and taken by the Council of The Corporation of the City of Burlington at this meeting are hereby adopted and confirmed as if same were expressly included in this by-law.
- 2. The Mayor and the proper officials of The Corporation of the City of Burlington are hereby authorized and directed to do all things necessary to give effect to the action of the Council of The Corporation of the City of Burlington referred to in Section 1.

- The Mayor, or in the absence of the Mayor, the Deputy Mayor, and the Clerk, or in the absence of the Clerk, the Deputy Clerk,
 - a) are authorized and directed to execute all documents necessary to the
 action taken by Council as described in Section 1, and
 - b) Are authorized and directed to affix the seal of The Corporation of the City of Burlington to all such documents referred to in Section 1.
- 4. This by-law comes into force on the day upon which is enacted by the Council of the Corporation of the City of Burlington.

Passed this 25th day, of November, 2024	
Mayor Marianne Meed Ward	
Deputy Clerk Lisa Palermo	